


COUNTY OF ERIE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT & PLANNING
DIVISION OF SEWERAGE MANAGEMENT
**** MEMORANDUM ****

FROM: Joseph Fiegl, P.E., BCEE, Deputy Commissioner 
TO: **BOARD OF MANAGERS ERIE COUNTY SEWER DISTRICT NO. 8**
DATE: October 30, 2025
RE: Erie County Sewer District (ECSD) No. 8
East Aurora WRRF Electrical Upgrades Project
Construction Inspection Services

The Division of Sewerage Management (DSM) issued a request for proposals (RFP) for firms to provide construction inspection services for the East Aurora Water Resource Recovery Facility (WRRF) Electrical Upgrades Project – Contract No. 25, in ECSD No. 8. The following firms submitted proposals in response to the RFP by the September 25, 2025 deadline: LaBella Associates D.P.C. (LaBella), Nussbaumer & Clarke, Inc. (N&C), and T.Y. Lin Engineering & Architecture, P.C. (TYLin). A committee of three (3) members was assembled to review and evaluate all submitted proposals using the DSM's established scoring matrix. Below were the initial rankings:

Rater	Based on Qualifications Only		
	<i>LaBella</i>	<i>N&C</i>	<i>TYLin</i>
Rater #1	#2	#1	#3
Rater #2	#1	#2	#3
Rater #3	#1	#2	#3
Average Qualifications Scoring	1.33	1.67	3.00
QUALIFICATIONS RANKING	#1	#2	#3

Cost proposals were opened after qualifications rankings were submitted:

- LaBella: \$249,949.62
- N&C: \$232,605.52
- TYLin: \$538,228.67

The members of the review committee noted that the three (3) firms were qualified to complete the work; however, based on a scoring of qualifications LaBella and N&C were the top respondents due to their grasp of scope and their plan to deliver the requested services. All the committee members noted that TYLin seemed to have some misunderstanding of the assignment, which was reflected in the number of labor hours proposed. With TYLin's cost being more than double that of the other respondents, the firm was removed from further consideration.

The majority of the review committee ranked Labella first based on qualifications. The positive attributes noted by the committee were their continuity with the proposed project as the design engineer, their familiarity with site and construction logistics at this location, a proposed team with clearly defined roles that has successfully delivered construction projects at the WRRF, and more. The review committee members noted N&C did a good

job with their proposal, submitting a solid team with relevant inspection-related capabilities. While N&C does not have specific work experience at the East Aurora WRRF, their proposal demonstrated they had successfully completed inspection for other wastewater treatment plant and electrical upgrade projects. N&C fell below LaBella in a few rating criteria. For example, N&C's M/WBE plan included 20-25% utilization, which was short of LaBella's proposed 90% M/WBE utilization. LaBella's utilization percentage was not only superior, but their plan seemed to better integrate the M/WBE subcontractor into the overall team as opposed to an "add-on".

Regarding the difference in cost, for a construction project of this magnitude (almost \$4.3 million) the proposed costs for LaBella and N&C were quite similar. One review committee member noted that LaBella has been very efficient in past projects and may not need some of the labor hours in their proposal. Furthermore, with a single firm responsible for the design and all construction phase services, there would be a benefit to the project.

After these discussions it was the unanimous recommendation of the review committee to proceed with LaBella. A suggested resolution is enclosed for the Board's consideration. The recommended funding source is capital reserves. Thank you.

Encl.

cc: D. Millar / M. Salah / M. Plesh / 8.3.3.25-CI

V:\DSM\Projects\RFP's and RFQ's\D8-EAWRRF-ElectricalUpgrades-Insp\Selection\BOM Reso - Electrical Inspection Award.doc

**RESOLUTION
BOARD OF MANAGERS
ERIE COUNTY SEWER DISTRICT (ECSD) NO. 8**

WHEREAS, the County of Erie advertised for and received responses to a Request for Proposals from consulting firms to perform construction inspection services for the East Aurora Water Resource Recovery Facility (WRRF) Electrical Upgrades Project; and

WHEREAS, a review committee was established to evaluate all responses to the County's Request for Proposals, using a consistent scoring matrix; and

WHEREAS, the proposal review committee recommends LaBella Associates D.P.C. to complete the requested consulting services.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT,

RESOLVED, that the ECSD No. 8 Board of Managers recommends award of an Agreement to LaBella Associates D.P.C., 300 Pearl Street, Suite 130, Buffalo, NY 14202 for construction inspection services for the the East Aurora WRRF Electrical Upgrades Project in an amount not to exceed \$250,000.00; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the ECSD No. 8 Board of Managers recommends capital reserves be the funding source for these services.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary Plesh, P.E.
Secretary – Board of Managers

Moved by: _____

Seconded by: _____

Approved/Disapproved: _____

Date: _____